

GATE Problems on Optimization

- 1) A transportation problem for which the costs, origin and availabilities, destination and requirements are given as follows:

	D_1	D_2	D_3	
Q_1	2	1	2	40
Q_2	9	4	7	60
Q_3	1	2	9	10
	40	50	20	

Check whether the following basic feasible solution

$$x_{11} = 20, x_{13} = 20, x_{21} = 10, x_{22} = 50$$

$$x_{33} = 10 \text{ and } x_{12} = x_{23} = x_{32} = x_{33} = 0$$

is optimal. If not, find an optimal solution.

- 2) The objective function of the dual problem for the following primal linear programming problem:

$$\text{Maximize } f = 2x_1 + x_2$$

Subject to

$$x_1 - 2x_2 \geq 2,$$

$$x_1 + 2x_2 = 8,$$

$$x_1 - x_2 \leq 11,$$

with $x_1 \geq 0$ and x_2 unrestricted in sign, is given by

(A) minimize $z = 2y_1$ (C) minimize $z = 2y_1$
 $-8y_2 + 11y_3$ $-8y_2 - 11y_3$

(B) minimize $z = 2y_1$ (D) minimize $z = 2y_1$
 $+8y_2 + 11y_3$ $+8y_2 - 11y_3$

- 3) Solve the following linear programming problem using the Simplex method:

$$\text{Minimize } f = -40x_1 - 100x_2$$

Subject to

$$10x_1 + 5x_2 \leq 2500,$$

$$4x_1 + 10x_2 \leq 2000,$$

$$2x_1 + 3x_2 \leq 900,$$

$$x_1 \geq 0, x_2 \geq 0.$$

- 4) Consider the primal problem (LP)

$$\max 4x_1 + 3x_2$$

subject to

$$x_1 + x_2 \leq 8$$

$$2x_1 + x_2 \leq 10$$

$$x_1 \geq 0, x_2 \geq 10$$

together with its dual (LD). Then

(A) (LP) and (LD) both are infeasible. (C) (LP) is feasible but (LD) is infeasible.

(B) (LP) and (LD) both are feasible. (D) (LP) is infeasible but (LD) is feasible.

- 5) Let Z^* denote the optimal value of LPP

$$\max Z = 4x_1 + 6x_2 + 2x_3$$

such that

$$3x_1 + 2x_2 + x_3 = 12$$

$$x_1 \geq 0, x_2 \geq 0, x_3 \geq 0.$$

Then

(A) $10 \leq Z^* \leq 20$ (C) $30 < Z^* \leq 40$

(B) $20 < Z^* \leq 30$ (D) $Z^* > 40$

- 6) Let x be a non-optimal feasible solution of a linear programming maximization problem and y a dual feasible solution. Then

(A) The primal objective value at x is greater than the dual objective value at y .

(B) The primal objective value at x could equal the dual objective value at y .

(C) The primal objective value at x is less than the dual objective value at y .

(D) The dual could be unbounded.

7) Consider the Linear Program

$$\text{Max} \sum_{i=1}^4 c_i x_i,$$

subject to

$$\sum_{i=1}^4 a_i x_i \leq a_0,$$

$$0 \leq x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \leq 1.$$

where $a_i > 0, c_i > 0$ for $i = 1, 2, 3, 4$ and $a_0 > 0$

(i) Write the dual of this Linear Programming Problem.

(ii) Assuming

$$\frac{c_1}{a_1} \geq \frac{c_2}{a_2} \geq \frac{c_3}{a_3} \geq \frac{c_4}{a_4},$$

$$a_1 + a_2 \leq a_0, \text{ and } a_1 + a_2 + a_3 > a_0,$$

show that the feasible solution

$$x_1 = x_2 = 1, x_3 = \frac{a_0 - a_1 - a_2}{a_3}, x_4 = 0,$$

is an optimal solution.

8) Consider the optimal assignment problem, in which n persons P_1, P_2, \dots, P_n are to be assigned n jobs J_1, J_2, \dots, J_n and where the effectiveness rating of the person P_i for the job J_j is $a_{ij} > 0$. The objective is to find an assignment of persons to jobs, that is, a permutation $\sigma : \{1, 2, \dots, n\} \rightarrow \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ which assigns person P_i to job $J_{\sigma(i)}$, so as to maximize the total effectiveness $\sum_{i=1}^n a_{i\sigma(i)}$. Show that in any optimal assignment, at least one person is assigned a job at which he is best.

9) Suppose that the linear programming problem $P : \text{Min } z = c^T x \text{ s.t. } Ax \geq b, x \geq 0$, where A is an $m \times n$ matrix, c an $n \times 1$ vector and b an $m \times 1$ vector, is being solved by the dual Simplex Algorithm. Then

(A) the value of the primal objective function increases at every iteration

(B) the algorithm will always terminate with an optimal solution for the dual

(C) the algorithm will always terminate with an optimal solution to the primal

(D) it is not always possible to obtain a starting basis for this algorithm

10) Consider the transportation problem given below. The bracketed elements in the table indicate a feasible solution and the elements on the left hand corner are the costs c_{ij}

	a_i			
	2	5	1	1
	(1)			2
	1	3	4	
		(1)	(1)	
b_j	1	1	1	3

(A) this solution is a basic feasible solution

(B) this solution can be made basic feasible

(C) this is an optimal solution

(D) the problem does not have an optimal solution

11) Consider the linear programming formulation (P2) of optimally assigning n men to n jobs with respect to some costs $\{c_{ij}\}_{i,j=1}^n$. Let A denote the coefficient matrix of the constraint set. Then,

(A) rank of A is $2n-1$ and every basic feasible solution of P2 is integer valued.

(B) rank of A is $2n-1$ and every basic feasible solution of P2 is not integer valued.

(C) rank of A is $2n$ and every basic feasible solution of P2 is integer valued.

(D) rank of A is $2n$ and every basic feasible solution of P2 is not integer valued.

12) Simplex tableau for phase I of the simplex algorithm for a linear programming problem is

given below (x_3, x_4, x_5 are artificial variables):

Basis	x_1	x_2	x_3	x_4	x_5	RHS
$Z_j - C_j$	0	0	-2	-2	0	0
x_1	1	0	$\frac{3}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$	0	2
x_2	0	1	$-\frac{2}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$	0	0
x_3	0	0	-1	-1	1	0

Choose the correct statement

- (A) the tableau does not show the end of phase I, since the artificial variable x_5 is in the basis
- (B) the tableau does show the end of phase I, since the value of the phase I objective function is zero
- (C) the constraints for the original linear programming problem are not redundant
- (D) the original linear programming problem does not have a feasible solution
- 13) Given below is the final tableau of a linear programming problem (x_4 and x_5 are slack variables):

Basis	x_1	x_2	x_3	x_4	x_5	RHS
$Z_j - C_j$	0	0	3	5	1	8
x_1	1	0	1	4	-1	2
x_2	0	1	2	-1	1	3

If the right hand side vector $\frac{1}{3}$ of the problem

gets changed to $\frac{1+\theta}{3}$, then the current basic feasible solution is optimal for

- (A) all $\theta \leq 2$
- (B) all $\theta \geq -\frac{1}{4}$
- (C) all $\theta \in \left[-\frac{1}{2}, 2\right]$
- (D) no non-zero value of θ
- 14) Consider the Linear Programming Problem (LPP):
 Maximize x_1 ,
 subject to: $3x_1 + 4x_2 \leq 10$, $5x_1 - 2x_2 \geq -2$,
 $x_1 - 3x_2 \leq 3$, $x_1, x_2 \geq 0$.
 The value of the LPP is

- (A) $\frac{9}{5}$ (B) 2 (C) 3 (D) $\frac{10}{3}$

- 15) The unit cost c_{ij} of producing i at plant j is given by the matrix :

$$\begin{pmatrix} 14 & 12 & 16 \\ 21 & 9 & 17 \\ 9 & 7 & 5 \end{pmatrix}$$

The total cost of optimal assignment is

- (A) 20 (C) 25
- (B) 22 (D) 28
- 16) Consider the following primal Linear Programming Problem (LPP).
 Maximize $z = 3x_1 + 2x_2$
 subject to $x_1 - x_2 \leq 1$

$$x_1 + x_2 \geq 3$$

$$x_1, x_2 \geq 0$$

The dual of this problem has

- (A) infeasible (C) a unique optimal solution
- (B) unbounded (D) infinitely many optimal solutions
- 17) The cost matrix of a Transportation Problem is given by

6	4	1	5
8	9	2	7
4	3	6	2

The following values of the

basic variables were obtained at the first iteration:

$$x_{11} = 6, x_{12} = 8, x_{22} = 2, x_{23} = 14, x_{33} = 1, x_{34} = 4.$$

Then

- (A) the current solution is optimal
- (B) the current solution is nonoptimal and the entering and leaving variables are x_{31} and x_{33} respectively

$$\sum_{i=1}^4 x_{ij} = 3, \quad i = 1, \dots, 4$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^4 x_{ij} = 3, \quad j = 1, \dots, 4.$$

$$x_{ij} \geq 0, \quad i, j = 1, \dots, 4.$$

Then, the dimension of S is equal to

- (A) 4 (C) 8
 (B) 9 (D) 12

Data for the following two questions:

Consider the Linear Programming Problem P:

$$\text{Max } c_1x_1 + c_2x_2 + \dots + c_nx_n$$

$$\text{s.t. } \sum_{i=1}^n a_{ij}x_j \leq b_i, \quad i = 1, \dots, m,$$

$$x_j \geq 0, \quad j = 1, \dots, n,$$

with m constraints in n non-negative variables.

- 24) Let $x^* = (x_1^*, x_2^*, \dots, x_n^*)$ be an optimal extreme point solution to P with $x_1^*, x_2^*, x_3^*, \dots, x_n^* > 0$. Then, out of the m constraints $\sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij}x_j \leq b_i, \quad i = 1, \dots, m$, the number of constraints not satisfied with equality at x^* is
- (A) at most $m-4$ (C) equal to $m-3$
 (B) at most $n-4$ (D) equal to $m-2$
- 25) Treat c_i 's, a_{ij} 's as fixed and consider the problem P for different values of b_i 's. Let P be unbounded for some set of parameters b_1, b_2, \dots, b_m . Then
- (A) $n > m$
 (B) P is either unbounded or infeasible for every choice of b_i 's
 (C) $m > n$
 (D) P has an optimal solution for some choice of b_i 's.

- 26) Consider the linear programming problem,

$$\text{max } z = c_1x_1 + c_2x_2, \quad c_1, c_2 > 0$$

$$\text{Subject to } x_1 + x_2 \leq 3$$

$$2x_1 + 3x_2 \leq 4$$

$$x_1, x_2 \geq 0.$$

Then,

- (A) The primal has an optimal solution but the dual does not have an optimal solution.
 (B) Both the primal and the dual have optimal solutions
 (C) The dual has an optimal solution but the primal does not have an optimal solution
 (D) Neither the primal nor the dual have optimal solutions.
- 27) For each $a \in \mathbb{R}$, consider the linear programming problem

$$\text{Max } z = x_1 + 2x_2 + 3x_3 + 4x_4$$

subject to

$$ax_1 + 2x_2 \leq 1$$

$$x_1 + ax_2 + 3x_4 \leq 2$$

$$x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \geq 0$$

Let $S = \{ a \in \mathbb{R} : \text{the given LP problem has a basic feasible solution} \}$. Then

- (A) $S = \phi$ (C) $S = (0, \infty)$
 (B) $S = \mathbb{R}$ (D) $S = (-\infty, 0)$
- 28) Consider the linear programming problem

$$\text{Max } z = x_1 + 5x_2 + 3x_3$$

subject to

$$2x_1 - 3x_2 + 5x_3 \leq 3$$

$$3x_1 + 2x_3 \leq 5$$

$$x_1, x_2, x_3 \geq 0.$$

Then the dual of this LP problem

- (A) has a feasible solution but does not have a basic feasible solution
 (B) has a basic feasible solution
 (C) has infinite number of feasible solutions

(D) has no feasible solution

29) Let $c_{ij} \geq 2$ be the cost of the $(i, j)^{th}$ cell of an assignment problem. If a new cost matrix is generated by the elements $c_{ij} = \frac{1}{2}c_{ij} + 1$, then

(A) optimal assignment plan remains unchanged and cost of assignment decreases

(B) optimal assignment plan changes and cost of assignment decreases

(C) optimal assignment plan remains unchanged and cost of assignment increases

(D) optimal assignment plan changes and cost of assignment increases

30) Let a primal linear programming admit an optimal solution. Then the corresponding dual problem

(A) does not have a feasible solution

(B) has a feasible solution but does not have any optimal solution

(C) does not have a convex feasible region

(D) has an optimal solution

31) The cost matrix of a transportation problem is given by

1	2	3	4
4	3	2	0
0	2	2	1

The following are the values of variables in a feasible solution

$$x_{12} = 6, x_{23} = 2, x_{24} = 6, x_{31} = 4, x_{33} = 6$$

Then which of the following is correct??

(A) The solution is degenerate and basic

(B) The solution is non-degenerate and basic

(C) The solution is degenerate and non-basic

(D) The solution is non-degenerate and non-basic

32) The maximum value of $z = 3x_1 - x_2$ subject to $2x_1 - x_2 \leq 1$, $x_1 \leq 3$ and $x_1, x_2 \geq 0$ is

(A) 0 (B) 4 (C) 6 (D) 9

33) Consider the problem of maximizing $z = 2x_1 + 3x_2 - 4x_3 + x_4$ subject to

$$x_1 + x_2 + x_3 = 2,$$

$$x_1 - x_2 + x_3 = 2,$$

$$2x_1 + 3x_2 + 2x_3 - x_4 = 0,$$

$$x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \geq 0.$$

Then

(A) $(1, 0, 1, 4)$ is a basic feasible solution but $(2, 0, 0, 4)$ is not

(B) $(1, 0, 1, 4)$ is not a basic feasible solution but $(2, 0, 0, 4)$ is

(C) neither $(1, 0, 1, 4)$ nor $(2, 0, 0, 4)$ is a basic feasible solution

(D) both of $(1, 0, 1, 4)$ and $(2, 0, 0, 4)$ are basic feasible solutions

34) Which one of the following is TRUE??

(A) Every linear programming problem has a feasible solution.

(B) If a linear programming problem has an optimal solution then it is unique.

(C) The union of two convex sets is necessarily convex.

(D) Extreme points of the $x^2 + y^2 \leq 1$ are the point on the circle $x^2 + y^2 = 1$.

35) The dual of the linear programming problem Minimize $c^T x$ subject to $Ax \geq b$ and $x \geq 0$ is

(A) Maximize $b^T w$ subject to $A^T w \geq c$ and $w \geq 0$

(B) Maximize $b^T w$ subject to $A^T w \leq c$ and $w \geq 0$

(C) Maximize $b^T w$ subject to $A^T w \leq c$ and w is unrestricted

(D) Maximize $b^T w$ subject to $A^T w \geq c$ and w is unrestricted

36) The minimum value of $z = 2x_1 - x_2 + x_3 - 5x_4 + 22x_5$ subject to

$$\begin{aligned} x_1 - 2x_4 + x_5 &= 6 \\ x_2 + x_4 - 4x_5 &= 3 \\ x_3 + 3x_4 + 2x_5 &= 10 \\ x_j &\geq 0, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, 5 \end{aligned}$$

is

- (A) 28 (B) 19 (C) 10 (D) 9

37) Using the Hungarian method, the optimal value of the assignment problem whose cost matrix is given by

5	23	14	8
10	25	1	23
35	16	15	12
16	23	11	7

is

- (A) 29 (B) 52 (C) 26 (D) 44

38) The following table gives the cost matrix of a transportation problem

4	5	6
3	2	2
1	1	2

The basic feasible solution given by $x_{11} = 3,$

$x_{13} = 1, x_{23} = 6, x_{31} = 2, x_{32} = 5$ is

- (A) degenerate and optimal
 (B) optimal but not degenerate
 (C) degenerate but not optimal
 (D) neither degenerate nor optimal

39) If z^* is the optimal value of the linear programming problem

Maximize $z = 5x_1 + 9x_2 + 4x_3$
 subject to $x_1 + x_2 + x_3 = 5$
 $4x_1 + 3x_2 + 2x_3 = 12$
 $x_1, x_2, x_3 \geq 0$
 then

- (A) $0 \leq z^* < 10$ (C) $20 \leq z^* < 30$
 (B) $10 \leq z^* < 20$ (D) $30 \leq z^* < 40$

40) The Linear Programming Problem:

Maximize $z = x_1 + x_2$
 subject to

$$\begin{aligned} x_1 + 2x_2 &\leq 20 \\ x_1 + x_2 &\leq 15 \\ x_2 &\leq 6 \\ x_1, x_2 &\geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

- (A) has exactly one optimum solution (C) has unbounded solution
 (B) has more than one optimum solution (D) has no solution

41) Consider the Primal Linear Programming Problem:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{P: } & \left\{ \begin{aligned} & \text{Maximize } z = c_1x_1 + c_2x_2 + \dots + c_nx_n \\ & \text{subject to} \\ & a_{11}x_1 + a_{12}x_2 + \dots + a_{1n}x_n \leq b_1 \\ & a_{21}x_1 + a_{22}x_2 + \dots + a_{2n}x_n \leq b_2 \\ & \dots \\ & a_{m1}x_1 + a_{m2}x_2 + \dots + a_{mn}x_n \leq b_m \\ & x_j \geq 0, \quad j = 1, \dots, n. \end{aligned} \right. \end{aligned}$$

The Dual of P is

$$\begin{aligned} \text{D: } & \left\{ \begin{aligned} & \text{Minimize } z' = b_1w_1 + b_2w_2 + \dots + b_mw_m \\ & \text{subject to} \\ & a_{11}w_1 + a_{12}w_2 + \dots + a_{m1}w_m \leq c_1 \\ & a_{12}w_1 + a_{22}w_2 + \dots + a_{m2}w_m \leq c_2 \\ & \dots \\ & a_{1n}w_1 + a_{2n}w_2 + \dots + a_{mn}w_m \leq c_n \\ & w_i \geq 0, \quad i = 1, \dots, m. \end{aligned} \right. \end{aligned}$$

Which of the following statements is FALSE?

- (A) IF P has an optimal solution, then D also has an optimal solution
 (B) The dual of the dual problem is a primal problem

(C) If P has an unbounded solution, then D has no feasible solution

(D) If P has no feasible solution, then D has a feasible solution

- 42) We have to assign four jobs I,II,III,IV to four workers A,B,C and D. The time taken by different workers (in hours) in completing different jobs is given below:

The optimal assignment is as follows:

		I	II	III	IV
Workers	A	5	3	2	8
	B	7	9	2	6
	C	6	4	5	7
	D	5	7	7	8

Job III to worker A; Job IV to worker B; Job II to worker C and Job I to worker D and hence the time taken by different workers in completing different jobs is now changed as: Then the minimum time (in hours) taken by

		I	II	III	IV
Workers	A	5	3	2	5
	B	7	9	2	3
	C	4	2	3	2
	D	5	7	7	5

the workers to complete all the jobs is

(A) 10 (B) 12 (C) 15 (D) 17

- 43) The following table shows the information on the availability of supply to each warehouse, the requirement of each market and unit of transportation cost (in rupees) from each warehouse to each market. The present transporta-

		Market				Supply
		M_1	M_2	M_3	M_4	
Warehouse	W_1	6	3	5	4	22
	W_2	5	9	2	7	15
	W_3	5	7	8	6	8
Requirement		7	12	17	9	

tion schedule is as follows:

W_1 to M_2 : 12 units; W_1 to M_3 : 1 unit; W_1 to M_4 : 9 units; W_2 to M_3 : 15 units; W_3 to M_1 : 7 units and W_3 to M_3 : 1 unit. Then the minimum total transportation cost (in rupees) is

(A) 150 (B) 149 (C) 148 (D) 147

- 44) Consider the linear programming problem:

Maximize $x + \frac{3}{2}y$ subject to

$$2x + 3y \leq 16,$$

$$x + 4y \leq 18,$$

$$x \geq 0, y \geq 0.$$

If S denotes the set of all solutions of the above problem, then

(A) S is empty (C) S is a line segment
(B) S is a singleton (D) S has positive area

- 45) Consider the following linear programming problem:

Maximize $x + 3y + 6z - w$
subject to $5x + y + 6z + 7w \leq 20,$
 $6x + 2y + 2z + 9w \leq 40,$
 $x \geq 0, y \geq 0, z \geq 0, w \geq 0.$
Then the optimal value is

- 46) Let X be a convex region in the plane bounded by straight lines. Let X have 7 vertices. Suppose $f(x, y) = ax + by + c$ has maximum value M and minimum value N on X and $N < M$. Let $S = \{P: P \text{ is a vertex of X and } N < f(P) < M\}$. If S has n elements, then which of the following statements is TRUE?

(A) n cannot be 5 (C) n cannot be 3
(B) n can be 2 (D) n can be 4

- 47) Consider the following linear programming problem:

Minimize $x_1 + x_2$
Subject to:

$$2x_1 + x_2 \geq 8$$

$$2x_1 + 5x_2 \geq 10$$

$$x_1, x_2 \geq 0$$

The optimal value to this problem is

- 48) Consider the following linear programming problem:

Minimize: $x_1 + x_2 + 2x_3$
Subject to

$$\begin{aligned}x_1 + 2x_2 &\geq 4 \\x_2 + 7x_3 &\leq 5 \\x_1 - 3x_2 + 5x_3 &= 6 \\x_1, x_2 &\geq 0, \quad x_3 \text{ is unrestricted}\end{aligned}$$

The dual to this problem is:

Maximize: $4y_1 + 5y_2 + 6y_3$
Subject to

$$\begin{aligned}y_1 + y_3 &\leq 1 \\2y_1 + y_2 - 3y_3 &\leq 1 \\7y_2 + 5y_3 &= 2\end{aligned}$$

and further subject to:

- (A) $y_1 \geq 0$, $y_2 \leq 0$ and y_3 is unrestricted
- (B) $y_1 \geq 0$, $y_2 \geq 0$ and y_3 is unrestricted
- (C) $y_1 \geq 0$, $y_3 \leq 0$ and y_2 is unrestricted
- (D) $y_3 \geq 0$, $y_2 \leq 0$ and y_1 is unrestricted

- 49) Consider the linear programming problem
Maximize $3x + 9y$,
Subject to

$$\begin{aligned}2y - x &\leq 2 \\3y - x &\geq 0 \\2x + 3y &\leq 10 \\x, y &\geq 0.\end{aligned}$$

Then the maximum value of the objective function is equal to

- 50) Minimize $w = x + 2y$ subject to

$$\begin{aligned}2x + y &\geq 3 \\x + y &\geq 2 \\x \geq 0, y &\geq 0\end{aligned}$$

Then, the minimum value of w is equal to

- 51) Maximize $w = 11x - z$ subject to

$$\begin{aligned}10x + y - z &\leq 1 \\2x - 2y + z &\leq 2 \\x, y, z &\geq 0.\end{aligned}$$

Then, the maximum value of w is equal to

- 52) Consider the linear programming problem (LPP):

Maximize $4x_1 + 6x_2$
Subject to $x_1 + x_2 \leq 8$,
 $2x_1 + 3x_2 \geq 18$,
 $x_1 \geq 6$, x_2 is unrestricted in sign.
Then the LPP has

- (A) no optimal solution
- (B) only one basic feasible solution and that is optimal
- (C) more than one basic feasible solution and a unique optimal solution
- (D) infinitely many optimal solutions

- 53) For a linear programming problem (LPP) and its dual, which one of the following is NOT TRUE?

- (A) The dual of the dual is primal
- (B) If the primal LPP has an unbounded objective function, then the dual LPP is feasible
- (C) If the primal LPP is infeasible, then the dual LPP must have unbounded objective function
- (D) If the primal LPP has a finite optimal solution, then the dual LPP also has a finite optimal solution

- 54) Consider the following transportation problem. The entries inside the cells denote per unit cost of transportation from the origins to the destinations. The optimal cost of transportation equals

		Destination			Supply
		1	2	3	
Origin	1	4	3	6	20
	2	7	10	5	30
	3	8	9	7	50
Demand		10	30	60	

55) Consider the linear programming problem (LPP):

Maximize $kx_1 + 5x_2$

Subject to $x_1 + x_2 \leq 1$,

$2x_1 + 3x_2 \leq 1$,

$x_1, x_2 \geq 0$.

If $x^* = (x_1^*, x_2^*)$ is an optimal solution of the above LPP with $k=2$, then the largest value of k (rounded to 2 decimal places) for which x^* remains optimal equals